

# Historic District Commission

March 23, 2017

## Minutes

Chairman Jennifer Stepp called the regular meeting of the Historic District to order at 6:08 p.m. on Thursday, March 23, 2017 at City Hall in the Council Chambers.

Present: Commissioners Carol Hauer, Dwayne JohnPaoli, Vice-Chairman William Blackwelder, and Chairman Jennifer Stepp. Commissioner Ed Starr arrived at 6:15 p.m.

Absent: Commissioner Ben Brackett

Staff present: Kim Wallis, Design Planner I and Chrystal Howard, Secretary

### **ITEM 1a. Roll Call / Sound Check**

Chairman Stepp opened the meeting and declared a quorum.

### **ITEM 1b. Adoption of the Agenda**

Commissioner Hauer made a motion to accept the agenda as presented and Commissioner JohnPaoli seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously (4-0).

### **ITEM 1c. Approval of Minutes**

Commissioner JohnPaoli made a motion to approve the December 15, 2016 minutes and Commissioner Blackwelder seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously (4-0).

Chairman Stepp stated that because of the quasi-judicial format of the hearings, persons wishing to speak and offer evidence are required by North Carolina law to be sworn in or affirmed, and asked all speakers to come forward to be sworn in or affirmed. Oaths of speakers were administered by Ms. Chrystal Howard.

Chairman Stepp explained the rules of procedure and order of business for the public hearings.

Chairman Stepp recognized Commissioner Ed Starr as present.

### **ITEM 2. Public Hearing – Certificate of Appropriateness (File # 8744)**

- Charlotte Walker Properties
- 523 W Fourth Avenue
- Reconstruction of second floor to include new roofline and new window configuration.

Chairman Stepp recognized Ms. Kim Wallis, Design Planner I, for the purpose of staff presentation.

Ms. Wallis stated that this request is to obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to reconstruct the entire second floor, including a new roofline and new window configuration. According to the York-Chester National Register Inventory, the property was built ca. 1938 and is one- and one-half-story brick house with a side-gable roof, 6/6 sash windows, a single-leaf entry, recessed entry porch with brick stoop and metal railing, gable vents, and a one-story rear wing. The property is zoned Residential Single Family (RS-8) and surrounded by other residential districts. It is considered a contributing building to the Historic District. The entire second floor from the ceiling of the first floor up has to be removed due to fire damage. The newly reconfigured second floor changes the home from a partial second story to a full second story. The roofline will change to a more symmetrical craftsman style roof with shed dormers off the front and rear and large gables on both sides. The front window configuration will change from two gabled dormers to four paired windows. The left side upper floor window configuration includes two new windows. The right side upper floor window configuration includes two new paired windows. The windows will be white vinyl with 6 over 6 grids to match existing windows. The large gables and the shed dormers will be a hardi-plank shake painted Rich Espresso with white trim. The roof will be black architectural style shingles. New construction should blend in with existing buildings in terms of design principles. (Design Guidelines, pg. 16). New construction should be compatible in materials, size, scale, color and texture with surrounding buildings. (Design Guidelines, pg. 17).

Commissioner Blackwelder asked if the house is transitioning from an all brick to a hardi-plank shake and Ms. Wallis answered that the house will remain brick at the bottom and the top floor will have the hardi-plank shake. Commissioner Blackwelder commented on the change from a two dormer to an extended dormer with four windows. Commissioner Blackwelder asked if the front of the house will be shake and hardi-plank across sides and back and Ms. Wallis answered yes, this is correct. No other questions were asked by the Commissioners.

## Historic District Commission

March 23, 2017

### Minutes

Commissioner JohnPaoli made the motion to close the public hearing and Commissioner Blackwelder seconded the motion. The board approved unanimously (5-0).

Discussion ensued amongst Commissioners regarding whether the existing windows were wood or vinyl framed.

Commissioner JohnPaoli made the motion to approve as presented and Commissioner Starr seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

#### **ITEM 3. Public Hearing – Certificate of Appropriateness (File # 8745)**

- Tom Cox with Green Apple House
- 416 W Second Avenue
- Existing vacant lot to be subdivided into two lots. On each lot to be new house construction, new driveway construction, and new landscaping

Chairman Stepp recognized Ms. Kim Wallis, Design Planner I, for the purpose of staff presentation.

Ms. Wallis stated that this request is to obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for construction of two new houses, two new driveways and new landscaping. The subject property is currently a vacant lot. The subject property is located in an O-1 Office Zoning District surrounded by other office and residential zoning. The applicant has a contract on the property. The property is .28 acres and will be subdivided into two lots on which the two new houses will be constructed. Per the Design Guidelines, the applicant met with a subcommittee of the HDC and staff on March 9, 2017, to informally discuss the applicant's intention. The houses will be single level classic "shotgun" bungalow cottages. The size will be 28 ft. x 58 ft. and 1546 sq. ft. in size, 23 ft. in height. The setbacks meet all zoning requirements. The houses will have a gable roof and intersecting gable. The building materials will be brick and Nichiha cement siding (simulated wood). It will be vertical board and batten. The windows will be vinyl clad with divided light grills as show on plan. The doors will be a fiberglass clad wood door with craftsman design as shown. The roof will be clad in architectural asphalt shingles. The driveways will be 10 ft. wide and of poured concrete, with pavers at beginning transitioning to the paved drive. The house on the right will share a driveway with a fence in the middle for separation. Landscaping will be as indicated on the site plan with Maple trees, Crape Myrtles in the front yard and shrubbery in the front and side(s) of house. One house will be painted the following Sherwin Williams Historic Colors: Body – Colonade Gray, Trim – Panda White, and Accent - Roycroft Brass and Roycroft Copper Red. The next house will be painted the following Sherwin Williams Historic Colors: Body – Labradorite Blue, Trim – Nacre Bone, and Accent –Artifact Gold. Ms. Wallis commented that the excerpts from the Design Guidelines can be found in the agenda.

Commissioner Starr asked if both structures will be identical and Ms. Wallis answered yes as the application was submitted.

Commissioner JohnPaoli commented that he was present at the subcommittee meeting with Mr. Tom Cox earlier this month. Commissioner JohnPaoli's focus was on moving the Hanna house and didn't realize the two houses would be identical.

Chairman Stepp inquired about 304 Hanna Street. Ms. Wallis stated her understanding of why the Hanna house will not be moved. Commissioner Hauer asked if anyone was interested in the house and Ms. Wallis stated not at this time. Ms. Wallis mentioned the possibility of moving the Hanna house to another city lot that would not be in York-Chester Historic District, but nearby. Some Commissioners stated their disappointment. Commissioner Starr commented that a Preservation of North Carolina posted a *For Sale to be Moved* sign in front of the house. No other questions were asked by the Commissioners.

Chairman Stepp recognized Mr. Robert Senior, 156 S South Street, Suite 301A of Gastonia, NC. Mr. Senior is in support of this request and is available to answer any design questions. Commissioner JohnPaoli stated his concern of two identical houses in a row and asked if there was any way to change this, such as make one porch elongated. Mr. Senior commented that the porch can be elongated along the front and the pitch or the roof can be changed. Mr. Senior reminded the board that the lots have a limited width and the property line for the house on the east side is in the middle of the driveway creating a shared drive. Lot E has more space to expand the house in some areas and define the porch and roof pitch. Commissioner JohnPaoli acknowledged his awareness of their budget and stated that any little change will make a difference. Mr. Senior commented that this house can have a larger window and elongated porch. Commissioner Starr commented that the slab

# Historic District Commission

March 23, 2017

## Minutes

foundation and vertical siding is not typical of the traditional houses in the neighborhood. Chairman Stepp is not in favor with the Nichiha cement siding. Commissioners Starr and Blackwelder and asked if it is feasible to mimic a crawlspace. Mr. Senior answered that the request is feasible. Commissioner JohnPaoli stated that in the subcommittee it was presented with a slab foundation, but then asked if it was possible to have the appearance of a crawlspace with stone. Mr. Senior stated that he was unable to answer this question. Commissioner JohnPaoli reiterated his awareness that Mr. Cox has a fixed budget on this project and is trying to compromise. Ms. Wallis commented that the Design Guidelines does not stipulate slab or crawlspace foundations for the Historic District.

Commissioner JohnPaoli made the motion to close the public hearing and Commissioner Starr seconded the motion. The board approved unanimously (5-0).

In summary of discussion, the Commissioners suggested enhanced “*beefed-up*” elements, such as elongating a porch, change the two windows into a double window, have one large front window, increasing size of side windows, use horizontal siding, mimic of crawlspace, and enhance lightweight column appearance so the houses harmonize with the neighborhood. The Commissioners stated that they will not approve of the request as presented.

All Commissioners shared their excitement and appreciation of the lot being used.

Commissioner Blackwelder made a motion to continue this request to provide ample time for Mr. Senior to discuss with Mr. Cox about Commissioners’ summarized recommendations and suggestions (enhanced “*beefed-up*” elements, such as elongating a porch, change the two windows into a double window, have one large front window, increasing size of side windows, use horizontal siding, mimic of crawlspace, and enhance lightweight column appearance) so the houses are not exactly alike and will harmonize with the neighborhood, and to provide revised drawings at the April 27, 2017 Historic District Commission Meeting. Commissioner Hauer seconded the motion and the motion was approved unanimously (5-0).

Chairman Goode asked Mr. Senior to convey a message to Mr. Cox that the board is very excited to have something on this lot and would like for it to be as congruent to the other buildings in the Historic District as possible.

#### **ITEM 4. Other Business**

The 2017 Bi-annual Review Process Schedule is a proposed schedule of the process for the Commissioners and staff to follow. Ms. Wallis explained the event/activity and corresponding dates. Commissioners are to confirm dates on the schedule with special attention to Tuesday, June 6, 2017. Ms. Wallis requested Commissioners to discuss the work session date and email availability. Chairman Goode requested a dinner be provided for the work session.

Next subcommittee meeting will be Thursday, April 6, 2017, if needed. No applications received at this time.

#### **ITEM 5. Adjournment**

There being no other business, Chairman Stepp adjourned the meeting at 7:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted:

---

Chrystal Howard, Secretary

---

Jennifer Stepp, Chairman