

Historic District Commission

June 28, 2018

Minutes

Chairman William Blackwelder called the meeting of the Historic District to order at 6:00 p.m. on Thursday, June 28, 2018 at City Hall in the Council Chambers.

Present: Commissioners Andi Eddlemon, Richard Ruhlman, William Blackwelder (Chair), Ed Starr, and Carol Hauer

Absent: Lynn Stepp

Staff present: Jason Thompson, Planning Director; Kim Wallis, Planner; and Chrystal Howard, Secretary

ITEM 1a. Roll Call / Sound Check

Chairman Blackwelder opened the meeting and declared a quorum.

ITEM 1b. Oath of Office

Ms. Howard administered the Oath of Office to Commissioners Carol Hauer and Richard Ruhlman.

ITEM 1b. Adoption of the Agenda

Commissioner Starr made the motion to adopt the Agenda. Chairman Blackwelder seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously (5-0).

ITEM 1c. Approval of Minutes

Commissioner Hauer made the motion to approve the May 24, 2018 minutes with Commissioner Eddlemon seconding the motion. The motion passed unanimously (5-0).

Chairman Blackwelder stated because of the quasi-judicial format of the hearings, persons wishing to speak and offer evidence are required by North Carolina law to be sworn in or affirmed, and asked all speakers to come forward to be sworn in or affirmed. Oaths of speakers were administered by Ms. Chrystal Howard.

Chairman Blackwelder provided an explanation for public hearings on Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) applications and the order of business.

ITEM 2. Public Hearing – Certificate of Appropriateness (File # 9038)

- First ARP Church
- 317 S Chester St
- Updated elevation drawing for construction of the Welcome Center

Chairman Blackwelder recognized Ms. Kim Wallis, Planner for the purpose of staff presentation.

Ms. Wallis stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for an updated elevation for the new construction of the Welcome Center. Ms. Wallis stated that the property is located in the York-Chester Historic District and is considered a Contributing Building to the Historic District. The applicant received an approved Certificate of Appropriateness at the Historic District Commission meeting in December 2017 for the construction of the Welcome Center. The elevation of this structure that was included in the December 2017 meeting agenda and presentation and that was approved by the HDC was submitted in error - it was an older version of the design and not the design that the church had approved. Therefore, the church resubmitted the application for the design of the Welcome Center with the correct elevation that has been approved by the church, for HDC consideration and approval. Ms. Wallis displayed the old elevation and proposed elevation designs. Ms. Wallis continued that all the construction design and materials of all buildings will be in keeping with the existing structure on the campus and the buildings approved at the last December HDC meeting. Ms. Wallis finished her presentation by reading the excerpts included in the staff report.

Chairman Blackwelder asked what the fundamental changes were and Ms. Wallis answered that the gables and roofline are different. Ms. Wallis referred this question to Mr. Paul Zugg.

Mr. Paul Zugg, 532 Stagecoach Drive of Anderson, SC was recognized. Mr. Zugg with Signature Architects from Clemson, SC stated that the church is considering a future balcony with stairs and the initial design accommodates a two-story height with the roofline matching the existing the building's roofline resulting in a lot of mass. After discussion with the church, the new design decreases the mass while keeping the access to the future balcony. Mr. Zugg explained the plate line changes, windows matching the sanctuary, roof line steps, and the new smaller scale elevation.

Historic District Commission

June 28, 2018

Minutes

Commissioner Starr stated that this design looked much better and Commissioner Hauer was in agreement.

Brief discussion ensued on the smaller scale.

Chairman Blackwelder reiterated that the materials and color previous approved will remain and Mr. Zugg confirmed this statement. Mr. Zugg stated that the windows and slate material will match, however, they are currently working on matching the existing brick. The four sets of handrails, toward S. Chester Street, will be painted.

No further questions were asked by the Commissioners.

Commissioner Hauer made the motion to close the public hearing and Chairman Blackwelder seconded the motion. No discussion occurred.

Commissioner Eddlemon made the motion to approve the request as presented and Chairman Blackwelder seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved (5-0).

ITEM 3. Public Hearing – Certificate of Appropriateness (File # 9039)

- John R. Martinez
- 501 W. Third Avenue
- Second-story porch remodel

Chairman Blackwelder recognized Ms. Kim Wallis, Planner for the purpose of staff presentation.

Ms. Wallis stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for a second-story porch remodel. The property is located in the York-Chester Historic District and is zoned residential, and the house was built around 1931 and is considered a Contributing Building to the district. Ms. Wallis read the findings, key elements of the design, and excerpts from the Design Guidelines provided in the staff report. Ms. Wallis displayed pictures of the old porch and new constructed porch that is currently unfinished.

Chairman Blackwelder asked if the porch was painted and if tin roofing was allowed. Ms. Wallis replied that the porch was not painted yet and that the Design Guidelines mention slate, clay, tile, metal and asphalt shingles are scattered throughout the history district as roofing materials. No further questions were asked by the Commissioners.

Mr. Richard Martinez, 501 W. Third Avenue of Gastonia, NC was recognized.

Commissioner Eddlemon commented on the balcony appearance above the front door as a Juliet balcony, and asked if the metal part of railing is consistent with the new portion. Martinez answered that it was a Juliet type of balcony and that he matched as best as he could.

Commissioners Ruhlman and Blackwelder inquired about the timeframe to complete the project. Mr. Martinez stated the expected completion time would take a couple more weeks.

Mr. Martinez apologized for being negligent for not bringing this matter to the Commissioners prior to today. He stated that the house suffered extensive damage because of the flat roof, and the second roof, which was placed for the preservation of the house, had to be elevated on one end. Extensive damage occurred to the room and outside of the living room and dining room area. Contractors informed him that the nature of the addition was not built properly resulting in the extensive damage.

Chairman Blackwelder asked if he used wood with rod iron railing and Mr. Martinez confirmed this was correct.

Commissioner Eddlemon asked if the wood will be painted including the underside of the ceiling structure and Mr. Martinez answered that all the wood will be painted. Mr. Martinez explained the location of the decorative Korbels as presented in the sketch. Commissioner Starr asked if the Korbels repeat anything existing on the house or if they are strictly decorative and Mr. Martinez replied that the Korbels were strictly decorative to make the home look more historic in nature.

Brief discussion ensued on the Korbels.

Historic District Commission

June 28, 2018

Minutes

No further questions were asked by the Commissioners.

Commissioner Hauer made the motion to approve the request as presented and Commissioner Ruhlman seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved (5-0).

ITEM 4. Other Business

First ARP Church Construction Update: Ms. Wallis gave an update on First ARP Church's construction. First ARP Church received an approved COA for landscaping plan. The plan showed the location of existing trees to be saved and removed, as well as new plantings. Construction started on this project and the contractor notified her and the Zoning Administrator of changes to the landscaping plan with regards to the saved trees. Some of the trees will be removed and some have been removed. The contractor had an independent arborist review and report on these specific 7 trees and their health before and after construction. The report was forwarded to the Commissioners. Ms. Wallis concluded that Tim Ramsey was present to answer any questions or concerns of the Commission. Tim Ramsey, Site Superintendent for Trehel Corporation identified the location of the trees removed or to be removed on the site plan displayed. Mr. Ramsey briefly explained each tree's characteristic, risk and recommendation written in the report. Discussion ensued on the landscaping and buffer requirements. Mr. Ramsey or Mr. Zugg stated that they will provide Ms. Wallis with a detailed list of shrubs and trees on the landscaping plan, including the proposed plants in lieu of trees being removed, as requested by Commissioners.

Subcommittee Meeting: No subcommittee meeting is needed tonight.

ITEM 5. Adjournment

There being no other business, Chairman Blackwelder adjourned the meeting at 6:54 p.m.

Respectfully submitted:

Crystal Howard, Secretary

William Blackwelder, Chairman