

Historic District Commission

September 8, 2021

Meeting Minutes

Chairwoman Andi Eddlemon called the special workshop of the Historic District Commission to order at 6:02 p.m. on Thursday, September 8, 2021 via Zoom.

Present: Commissioners Jerry Tucker, James Henson, Andi Eddlemon, Carol Hauer, and Camille Fox

Absent: Commissioners Ed Starr and Josh Hauser

Staff present: Kim Wallis, and Chrystal Howard

ITEM 1. Roll Call / Sound Check

Chairwoman Eddlemon opened the meeting, conducted roll call and declared a quorum.

ITEM 2. Discuss Historic District Design Guidelines

Chairwoman Eddlemon opened the workshop session and recognized Kim Wallis, Planner for the purpose of staff presentation.

Ms. Wallis commented that the July 22, 2021 public workshop and the 30-Day Public Review/Comment period are complete. Today is the Historic District Commission (HDC) work session to review its agenda of issues, the consolidated list of public comments, and discuss necessary design guidelines, updates and/or revisions. September 15, 2021 - September 30, 2021 will be the 14-Day Public Review/Comment Period and at the next HDC meeting in October, the commission will receive and discuss final comments and adopt revised guidelines. Ms. Wallis explained the three types of updates to the Design Guidelines; changes made to comply with Chapter 160D of our statewide land use laws, updates / additions to the current guidelines that reflect commission issues and public comments, and merging the Design Guidelines with the York-Chester and Brookwood handbooks. Ms. Wallis began her presentation with 1. The changes made to comply with Chapter 160D of our statewide land use laws. Ms. Wallis transitioned to 2. Updates / additions to the current guidelines that reflect commission issues and public comments. She reviewed public comments, emails, staff recommendations.

New section on Trees:

Ms. Wallis shared staff recommendations. Commissioner Henson recommended including the location of the measurement to the trees less than eight (8) inches in diameter sentence to eliminate confusion. Commissioner Hauer commented this section was necessary. Commissioner Fox asked who was responsible for the trees in the right-of-way along the sidewalk and Ms. Wallis replied that it was the city. Commissioner Fox stated some of her neighbors wanted to know the goal and recommendation of tree sizes in this area. Ms. Wallis replied that they would be understory. Chairwoman Eddlemon suggested each time the Commission reviews the Design Guidelines to review a different type of tree for variation. Ms. Wallis replied that an acceptable tree list document will be added to the Design Guidelines. No objections to the recommendations were stated.

New section on Accessory Buildings & Garages:

Ms. Wallis shared staff recommendations. Commissioner Henson inquired about the difference between a carriage and barn house style trim. Commissioner Henson stated he was thinking of Commissioners who will have to discern this in the future. Ms. Wallis stated a diagram to illustrate a barn style roof line and door can be included in this section. No objections to the recommendation were stated.

Fences and Walls:

Section A:

Ms. Wallis shared staff recommendations. Commissioner Henson asked if this was vinyl covered chain link fencing that would be allowed for the exception in rear yard fencing for institutional uses. Ms. Wallis replied that he was correct. Commissioner Henson recommended chain link and vinyl chain link fencing be specified. Chairwoman Eddlemon recommended examples of institutional uses, such as schools. Commissioner Tucker recommended looking at all sides for institutional uses and Ms. Wallis stated she will update the standards. Brief discussion ensued on wood fencing. Ms. Wallis encouraged the Commission to discuss the recommendation of '*wood fencing should be stained to match the house trim or painted white*'. Commissioner Tucker mentioned house trim can be a small component of a house façade, and it may not tie in. He suggested matching surroundings, but not obstructive. Commissioner Eddlemon commented that sometimes the house trim is a good thing to use especially for simplicity. Commissioner Hauer explained her house, trim and fence. Commissioner Fox suggested having the option of a wooden fence. Commissioner Tucker suggested different standards for solid stockade fences and picket fences. Chairwoman Eddlemon recommended keeping fencing standards general. Commissioner Henson commented that the vinyl chain link fence comes in

Historic District Commission

September 8, 2021

Meeting Minutes

several colors and recommended it be black covered vinyl chain link fencing. Commissioner Fox suggested color selection be approved at staff level. Commissioner Tucker recommended in terms of the wood fencing, since it will have to be approved by subcommittee or the full commission, some mention of the color approval or recommendation instead of just house trim or white. He stated it is limiting but offers flexibility on the standard so the applicant can approve a certain color. Ms. Wallis stated she will update and discuss this section with the Planning Director Jason Thompson.

Brief discussion ensued on painting brick houses and Ms. Wallis deferred this topic after discussion on Fences and Walls.

Section B:

Ms. Wallis shared staff recommendations. Ms. Wallis asked the Commission if they want this section to be discretionary dependent on the site and the Commission replied that they did.

Section E:

Ms. Wallis shared staff recommendations. Commissioners addressed concerns on not understanding the types of fences. Commissioner Fox commented that some yards are deep and back fences cannot be seen, and encouraged allowing solid stockade fencing exceptions. Ms. Wallis stated examples of specifics and photos will be included and solid stockade fencing exceptions can be included in specific situations. Chairwoman Eddlemon asked if recommended styles can be added in the standards and Ms. Wallis replied that it would be a good idea.

Section F:

Ms. Wallis shared staff recommendations. The Commission had no objection to removing the first sentence.

Before moving to Siding and Trim, Commissioner Tucker inquired about trees removed from the right-of-way and asked if the city will remove the stump at no cost and plant another tree. Ms. Wallis replied that it was being discussed. Ms. Wallis was unaware of the process, but will contact the city arborist.

Siding and Trim:

Ms. Wallis shared staff recommendations. The Commission had no objection to removing the two sentences as there is an Exterior Colors section (page 11) that talks about exterior colors and have moved beyond neutral, original and white. Ms. Wallis referred the Commission to page 11 of the Design Guidelines and also Appendix D - Exterior Paint Color Examples.

Referring to Siding and Trim Section g., Commissioner Tucker inquired if fiber cement siding was as engineered siding and commented on the contradiction. Brief discussion ensued on engineered or synthetic siding damaging to a historic material, other than vinyl, was aluminum. Ms. Wallis stated she will specify this in the standard.

Chairwoman Eddlemon was okay with removing staff recommendation sentences, but recommended having somewhere in the paint area that paint manufacturers have a historic line of paints. Several Commissioners agreed.

Masonry:

Ms. Wallis read from Commissioner Starr's comments, "Masonry, Item C - "Avoid painting masonry unless evidence suggests it was originally painted. Masonry has been defined as including brick, stone, stucco and concrete.", "I believe that stone should typically not be painted, but brick structures should be considered on an individual basis", "I believe that stone should typically not be painted, but brick structures should be considered on an individual basis.", "Some of the best looking houses in the Historic District (HD) are painted brick - examples are some houses in Forest Hills.", "Some styles of brick houses which should not be painted, such as Tudor style construction.", "Concrete construction is often greatly improved by painting.", and "Brick or concrete foundations are typically improved in appearance by being painted, especially on older structures where a lot of pointing up and repairs may have been done over the years." Ms. Wallis shared staff recommendations.

Discussion ensued on proposals. Regarding proposal #2, Commissioner Hauer stated there are two separate issues between improving the appearance of a house and preserving the material of the house. Several Commissioners were in agreement. Discussion ensued on improving the aesthetics of a home that are not appropriate for the historic district and painting considered as permanent. Regarding proposal #1, clarification was made to define *originally painted* to when the house was built and not prior to the HD designation. Regarding proposal #3, Ms. Wallis suggested removing *non-contributing* from the sentence. She commented about adding brick before 1950 was not coated because the materials had sufficient strength without paint and had decorative applications. After 1950 the process changed on how brick was created. The Commissioners had no objection with proposal #1 after

Historic District Commission

September 8, 2021

Meeting Minutes

clarification of its meaning; however, some Commissioners stated concerns with proposal #2 and proposal #3. Commissioner Tucker suggested removing proposal #3 as it did not seem necessary since very few homes were being built after 1950, the applicant will apply to the Commission or subcommittee for approval, and it creates confusion. Chairwoman Eddlemon agreed and commented that someone may think that it doesn't matter since their structure was built after 1950. Commissioner Hauer commented on the complexity of this section, but noted that the age of the house is something to consider. Chairwoman Eddlemon noted that decisions made about not painting brick was because it was not preserving the historic aesthetic of the neighborhood, there was little painted brick historically, and not intended to be painted. She suggested adding reasons why the Commission advocates for not painting brick and educational points. Ms. Wallis stressed on public comment on this section and Commissioner Starr's comments. Ms. Wallis stated she will update and discuss this section with Assistant City Attorney Charles Graham.

Brief discussion ensued on learning more about older buildings considered non-contributing, and if they can be added to the list as a contributing structure and Ms. Wallis will ask State Historic Preservation Office.

Fenestration:

Ms. Wallis shared staff recommendations and stated examples will be included in the standards. Commissioner Hauer shared a concern that while this allows a break from expense, it creates a lack of continuity and it changes how the structure looks. Chairwoman Eddlemon mentioned home values and commented on encouraging using quality materials that are true to the characteristics of the district. She added that windows are a huge component of the overall historic vibe and continuing on this path of allowing different windows was a concern. Commissioner Hauer stated this was a frequent violation of those that are flipping houses. Commissioner Henson commented on manufactures making grills to go in between the panes and energy efficiency. Ms. Wallis suggested reducing the proposal to read, "*If not true divided light windows, install Simulated Divided Light (SDL) windows with three dimensional grills affixed to both the interior and exterior of the window with shadow bars between insulated glass panes.*" Commissioner Tucker commented that the small muntins on the inside of the glass were not attractive, and he liked the SDLs. Brief discussion ensued on windows constructed out of solid vinyl plastic versus wood with a vinyl coating and the SDLs. Commissioner Tucker stated allowing different windows on the side and rear may be confusing and recommended being consistent around the house. Chairwoman Eddlemon recommended only adding, "*If not true divided light windows, install Simulated Divided Light (SDL) windows with three dimensional grills.*" She continued that this allows flexibility of a wood window, a true divided light window, and a SDL window. Commissioner Hauer agreed that windows need to be consistent around the house. Commissioner Tucker commented on prohibiting windows with the plastic on the inside between the glass. Ms. Wallis stated she will talk to Assistant City Attorney Charles Graham about the sentence, "*Materials are somewhat flexible.*"

New section on Shutters:

Ms. Wallis shared staff recommendations. Commissioner Hauer suggested adding an illustration and a comment that if the shutters are closed, they should meet. This would be after the sentence, "*New shutters should be sized to fit the window opening.*" Commissioner Tucker mentioned changing *should be* to *will be*. Chairwoman Eddlemon requested two more descriptors with farmhouse and also list stained cedar. Commissioner Fox requested clarification on new shutters for replacement and asked if the owner had a choice to upgrade or keep the same size. She gave an example that if homeowner had to upsize, they may not have the room to upsize to accommodate. Commissioner Hauer recommended adding to the sentence, *if size permits*. Commissioner Eddlemon asked for illustrations for this sentence. Ms. Wallis stated she will add examples. Commissioner Tucker was concerned about adding vinyl shutters to the list of inappropriate. He stated a vinyl shutter with wood grain can look as good as wood. Commissioner Hauer suggested if using vinyl shutters, vinyl will need to be approved by staff. Brief discussion ensued. Ms. Wallis stated she will rework this section.

Exterior Colors:

Ms. Wallis read from Commissioner Starr's comment regarding Item D and Item E, "These two guidelines seem to be in conflict with each other - and suggesting no more than two colors total on a house is very limiting.", and "We should encourage some creativity among our residents in order to create a more interesting and well-designed neighborhood." Ms. Wallis shared staff's recommendation. Commissioners were in favor of staff's recommendation. She displayed all of Commissioner Starr's comments.

Commissioner Tucker commented that the current Design Guideline was incredibly written from front to back. He mentioned satellite dishes and suggested changing meters to feet. Commissioner Tucker asked if a COA was needed to remove awnings and Ms. Wallis stated that applications have been received in the past. Commissioner Tucker stated it was implicit that a person needs to ask permission

Historic District Commission

September 8, 2021

Meeting Minutes

to remove an awning. Ms. Wallis stated he made a good point and this may need to be addressed at the beginning.

ITEM 3. Adjournment

There being no other business, Chairwoman Eddlemon adjourned the meeting at 7:32 p.m.

Respectfully submitted:

Chrystal Howard, Secretary

Andi Eddlemon, Chairwoman